



## Evaluation Analysis Based on The Cipp Model Vocational High School Guidance and Counseling Program: Expert Perspective, Guidance and Counseling Teacher, And Subject Teacher

Nina Permata Sari<sup>1\*</sup>, Muhammad Andri Setiawan<sup>1</sup>

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article History:

Received: 16 April 2023

Received in revised form: 07 November 2023

Accepted: 09 December 2023

DOI: 10.14689/ejer.2023.106.003

#### Keywords

Effectiveness of Guidance and Counselling Programs in Vocational Schools, Module Feasibility Assessment Instruments, Independent Curriculum in Vocational Schools, CIPP Evaluation Model, Vocational School Guidance and Counselling Program.

### ABSTRACT

**Purpose:** The primary objective of this study is to assess the efficacy of guidance and counselling initiatives within Vocational High Schools (SMK) through the application of a CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model-oriented framework. The overarching aim is to ascertain the effectiveness and alignment of these programs with the autonomous curriculum and the unique requirements of students. The ultimate intention is to enhance the quality of vocational school counselling by means of a standardized assessment process. **Method:** The study engaged 10 guidance counsellors and 10 teachers from SMK Negeri 3 Banjarmasin to evaluate the feasibility of a comprehensive CIPP assessment model in terms of clarity, adequacy, and suitability. Both quantitative and qualitative data were collected through surveys and analysed using statistical methods to gauge the model's feasibility.

**Findings:** Evaluation facets, encompassing the lucidity of assessment concepts, precision of evaluative instruments, and efficacy of evaluation models, garnered commendable appraisals across diverse respondent cohorts. The mean scores, ranging from 3.91 to 3.94 out of 5, denote a robust consensus. Favourable evaluations pertaining to assessment concepts, instrument clarity, model efficacy, and practical utility indicate the adeptness of the CIPP framework in evaluating vocational school counselling programs. Consistent affirmation from all respondent groups underscores CIPP's capacity to align programs with specific school contexts. **Originality:** This study presents a thorough evaluation methodology utilizing the CIPP model for assessing the alignment of vocational school guidance and counselling programs with the curriculum and student requirements. The specificity of the vocational school context ensures a targeted examination of career counselling initiatives. **Limitations:** The research was confined to a singular vocational high school with a modest sample size of 20 respondents. To enhance the robustness of the findings, broader investigations spanning diverse vocational schools and larger participant samples are recommended. Augmenting qualitative data collection methods holds the potential to yield more nuanced and comprehensive insights.

© 2023 Ani Publishing Ltd. All rights reserved.

<sup>1</sup> Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

\*Corresponding author: Email: [nina.bk@ulm.ac.id](mailto:nina.bk@ulm.ac.id)

## Introduction

In an ever-evolving education landscape, program evaluation is crucial to ensure the effectiveness and alignment of educational approaches with student needs and curriculum objectives (Eryanto, Swaramarinda, & Nurmalasari, 2019; Shu et al., 2023; Sugiyo & Muslikah, 2018). The objective of evaluating educational programs centres on the scrutiny and interpretation of principal program characteristics, with a focus on monitoring key variables that serve as indicators of program efficiency, effectiveness, and overall quality (Ponsiglione et al., 2022). Diverse methods for program evaluation are employed, including active and interactive approaches, which involve the exchange of information, receipt of feedback, and the creation of engaging educational scenarios (Kurganovna et al., 2022). Prevalently employed for this purpose is Stufflebeam's CIPP model, which serves as a prominent assessment tool for the analysis of needs, outcomes, and indicators. Conceived in 1960, this method has gained extensive utilization as an evaluative instrument in the field of education (Barber et al., 2020). Assessment utilizing the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model has emerged as a pivotal instrument for gauging and enhancing the quality of educational programs (Finney, 2019; Martaningsih & Istiyono, 2019; Utakrit & Siripanich, 2018). This model is specifically designed to facilitate and augment a systematic and comprehensive scrutiny of education-related projects that transpire within the dynamic contexts of the real world (Kuzu, Özkan, & Bada, 2021).

An area of education necessitating particular emphasis is the domain of guidance and counselling in vocational high schools, wherein program evaluation assumes a pivotal role in optimizing the efficacy of these programs (Barber et al., 2020; Gullickson et al., 2019; Poth et al., 2020; Sankaran & Saad, 2022). Vocational high schools implement various programs aimed at educating and training students to acquire diverse competencies essential for their future endeavours (Nurjanah et al., 2019). While graduates of vocational high schools are presumed to seamlessly transition into practical fields, the incidence of unemployment among such individuals remains elevated (Martaningsih & Istiyono, 2019). The success of counselling programs in vocational high schools relies on factors such as student attitudes, public perception, and organizational support. Therefore, it is crucial to investigate the role of evaluation programs in assessing guidance and counselling programs in these schools. This research aims to conduct a thorough analysis of the CIPP model-based evaluation in vocational guidance and counselling programs, addressing the identified problem (Iftikhar et al., 2022; Nursyamsiah, Bunyamin, & Muljono, 2023; Saptono, Herwin, & Firmansyah, 2021; Taridi et al., 2023). To attain this objective, the research adopts a multi-perspective approach to evaluation, incorporating insights from education experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers (Sudarwan, Edy, & Tola, 2021; Wilkins, 2022; Zheng et al., 2018). This approach offers a comprehensive perspective on the evaluation of guidance and counselling programs within the context of the Merdeka curriculum at the vocational school level.

Numerous existing studies have explored the impact of evaluation programs in different colleges like Sullivan et al. (2023) and Bhattacharjee et al. (2022) explored the role played by different evaluation programs in medical college. Nevertheless, a paucity of extant research has delved into the ramifications of career counselling evaluation initiatives within vocational colleges. The scant number of studies addressing this phenomenon in

vocational colleges has employed varied methodologies Küçükayhan and Adigüzel (2021) implemented a convergent parallel design to scrutinize programs in vocational education and Susatya et al. (2021) examined the evaluation of character strengthening programs in the respective colleges. While both studies yielded significant results, the analysis of counselling programs in vocational colleges using the CIPP model has been overlooked in existing literature. This study aims to address this gap by exploring the phenomenon through the lens of the CIPP model.

The evaluative framework grounded in the CIPP model accentuates assessment across four principal dimensions: Context, Input, Process, and Product. Collectively, these dimensions offer a holistic depiction of program effectiveness ((Mpuangnan, 2021; Shi et al., 2023; Winaryati & Hidayat, 2020). This analysis seeks to assess the clarity, adequacy, and appropriateness of each evaluation dimension, while also comprehending the perspectives of experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers regarding the evaluation of guidance and counselling programs in vocational schools (Ahmad & Saeed, 2021; Alsalamah, 2021; Mohanna et al., 2023) by conducting a case study at SMK Negeri 3 Banjarmasin, given its comparable quantity and quality to other vocational high schools.

This study holds both theoretical and practical significance, serving as an initial exploration into the development of the CIPP evaluation model for guidance and counselling programs. It offers valuable insights into the assessment of autonomous guidance and counselling initiatives at the vocational school level, with implications for potential enhancements. The results will serve as a foundational framework for crafting a more effective and sustainable evaluation model, thereby elevating the quality of guidance and counselling programs at the vocational school level. Additionally, the findings provide crucial insights for vocational high school personnel and policymakers, encouraging the formulation of policies to optimize the implementation of such programs in respective schools.

The subsequent sections of the paper are organized as follows. Section 2 delves into existing empirical studies relevant to the subject, providing a comprehensive discussion on the CIPP model, guidance and counselling programs, and related aspects with reference to prior research. Moving forward, the methodology section outlines the research methods and techniques employed for achieving conclusive results. Section 4 presents the obtained results, while Section 5 provides a detailed discussion of these findings. The final section encompasses the study's conclusion, implications, limitations, and directions for future research.

## Literature Review

This research primarily concentrates on evaluating guidance and counselling programs within the context of the independent curriculum at the SMK level. The evaluation is deemed essential to gauge the effectiveness and alignment of the independent curriculum with student needs and the goals of the guidance and counselling program in vocational schools. The CIPP model is considered as one of the approaches for this evaluation. Relevant studies, including those focusing on factors influencing the evaluation of educational programs and the utilization of e-learning technology in health education, provide valuable insights (Regmi & Jones, 2020) the capacity for self-directed learning within a dynamically evolving environment (Morris, 2019), and the facets constituting success among students in higher education (Lane et al., 2019).

Furthermore, pertinent research exists on the development of career guidance programs aimed at enhancing students' career awareness (Keumala, Nurihsan, & Budi Amin, 2018), competency-based education facilitating the transition of student nurses from academic training to professional practice (Hodges et al., 2019), and the evaluation of the CSE-UCLA model on the performance of school counsellors in Indonesia (Mohammad, Andi, & Karyanti, 2022). Additionally, studies investigating the significance of career outcomes for vocational school graduates in the labour market (Hambali, 2019) and the historical evolution of career guidance in secondary schools in Hong Kong (Wong & Yuen, 2019) are germane to the context of this research.

#### *CIPP Evaluation Model*

The CIPP evaluation model, initially introduced by Stufflebeam in 1966, affords a robust methodological underpinning for the assessment of educational programs. The CIPP evaluation model comprises four primary dimensions: context, input, process, and product. Its extensive application is observed in the analysis and enhancement of guidance and counselling programs at the vocational high school level (Gardner, 2019). Moreover, the CIPP evaluation model has found application in diverse educational settings, including the evaluation of entrepreneurship education (Liu, Wang, & Feng, 2022), assessing the calibre of student training within science and engineering programs (Duan et al., 2022), systemic cognition in the realm of education (Gallón, 2020), assessing the influence of community studies in programs focused on knowledge transfer (Madon et al., 2021), additionally, education of high quality (Leal Filho et al., 2020). The utilization of the CIPP evaluation model across diverse educational contexts underscores its adaptability and pertinence in the examination and enhancement of educational programs. Finney (2019) the utilization of the CIPP model suggests that one of its facets involves confirmatory evaluation, aiding in the ongoing enhancement of courses and presenting potential remedies. Within educational contexts, confirmatory evaluation based on the CIPP model furnishes pertinent and crucial information about the program, offering insights for program modification (Pramono, 2021). CIPP evaluation model posits that the success of an educational program is shaped by key factors such as environmental and student characteristics, program goals, and utilized instruments. Viewing a program as a system, this model emphasizes the evaluation of its components. Numerous studies have highlighted the potential and benefits of CIPP as an effective evaluation model.

#### *Evaluation of Guidance and Counselling Program*

Assessing guidance and counselling programs is gaining prominence amidst calls for educational system reforms. These programs in SMK play a vital role in assisting students with career understanding, future planning, and overcoming learning challenges. Research indicates that effective guidance and counselling programs positively influence students' career planning capabilities (Afanasiev et al., 2018), enhance perceptions of workplace engagement (Jackson & Tomlinson, 2020), and provide guidance services to teachers using technology (Supriyanto et al., 2020). Moreover, practicum and field manuals, as delineated in the research by Baird and Mollen (2023) offer valuable guidance for practitioners in assisting students to navigate challenges and comprehend their career choices. Arfasa and Weldmeskel (2020) conduct an analysis of the advantages and obstacles associated with

guidance and counselling programs in secondary schools in Ethiopia, revealing a positive perception from teachers and students. Nonetheless, the implementation efficiency of these programs is hindered in the majority of secondary schools due to constraints such as limited resources and time. The study of Cahyono (2022) highlight the significance of the Merdeka Belajar curriculum, emphasizing its noteworthy counselling and guidance programs that effectively contribute to the character development and performance enhancement of students. Furthermore, recognizing guidance and counselling programs as integral components of education, crucial for fostering students' independence and optimal development, underscores the pivotal role of evaluating such programs in vocational schools. This evaluation plays a crucial role in supporting student development and future planning.

#### *Independent Curriculum at Vocational School Level*

The Independent Curriculum has emerged as a central focal point for enhancing education quality in Indonesia. The application of CIPP model-based program evaluation within the framework of the Merdeka curriculum, specifically for guidance and counselling in SMK, poses a significant inquiry. The Merdeka curriculum, centred on the notion of independence, holds noteworthy implications for teachers and principals, guiding the development of curricula aligned with students' potential and needs (Mustafiyanti et al., 2023). Fransiska et al. (2023) underscore the advantages of the independent curriculum, emphasizing its effective integration into the school's management system. This curriculum introduces novel elements for students, fostering motivation and heightened enthusiasm for learning. Prior studies have recognized that the execution of educational initiatives, exemplified by the Teaching Campus (Oktapiani, Sutiono, & Choli, 2022) and Merdeka Belajar (Mastur, 2023), necessitates thorough evaluation. Additionally, the assessment of thematic learning amid the pandemic has emerged as a subject of research (Pujiastuti, Herwin, & Firdaus, 2021). Assessment is similarly implemented within the sphere of primary education, exemplified by programs like the Teaching Campus initiative in elementary schools (Indriani & Holisah, 2022). Furthermore, the interaction between educational institutions and collaborative partnership models constitutes pivotal elements in bolstering educational metamorphosis (Achmad & Utami, 2023). Hence, comprehending the evaluation of programs utilizing the CIPP model within the framework of the independent curriculum for guidance and counselling in vocational schools holds significant implications for fostering improvements in the quality of education in Indonesia.

#### *Experts' Perspectives*

The study focuses on the perspectives of education and guidance and counselling experts who have made crucial contributions to the development of the CIPP evaluation model for guidance and counselling programs. Including these expert viewpoints enriches the understanding of CIPP model-based evaluation. The study of Pordelan and Hosseinian (2022) assessed the efficacy of online counselling programs based on data derived from 20 experts in the relevant field. Likewise, McGrath et al. (2022) explore the advantages of character education and employed their practical advice to underscore the development of such programs. The insights from these experts, particularly higher education academics

specializing in educational research and evaluation, are invaluable as they offer a thorough examination of the issue and propose solutions accordingly (Mohanna et al., 2023; Supriyanto et al., 2019), experts in the field of guidance and counselling (Savickas, 2019), as well as guidance and counselling teacher practitioners (Crothers et al., 2020). They contribute their distinctive perspectives and experiences to this study, offering comprehensive insights into the evaluation of guidance and counselling programs within the framework of the independent curriculum in Vocational High Schools.

### *The Role of Guidance and Counselling Teachers and Subject Teachers*

Guidance and counselling educators play a pivotal role in overseeing evaluation initiatives within educational institutions, directly engaging with students. From this standpoint, Geesa et al. (2019) investigated the viewpoints of school leaders regarding the evaluation process of Comprehensive Guidance and Counselling (CSC) and the implementation of the American School Counsellor Association (ASCA) National Model. In the educational milieu, guidance and counselling educators, serving as advocates, play a significant role in appraising the efficacy of evaluation programs (Lowery et al., 2018). The studies of Azwar (2022) explored the function of counselling educators, highlighting their substantial impact by asserting that these professionals augment students' social awareness and contribute to the enhancement of their academic performance (Damana, 2022). Elicit the notion that counselling educators exert a substantial influence on the engagement and educational attainment of students. Furthermore, the pertinent research identifies that challenges encountered by counselling teachers can likewise affect students' performance. Additionally, subject teachers, possessing distinct perspectives, should be considered in program evaluation, given their pivotal role in the students' educational progression (Wong & Yuen, 2019). The collective input from both guidance and counselling teachers and subject teachers offers a comprehensive perspective for assessing program evaluation (Mertens & Wilson, 2018). In their capacity as career guides and counsellors within educational institutions, guidance and counselling educators assume a crucial role in assisting students in comprehending their career alternatives and formulating future plans (Howell et al., 2019).

Hence, employing the CIPP evaluation model is crucial for enhancing the effectiveness of guidance and counselling programs in vocational schools, taking into account diverse perspectives from experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers.

### **Research Method**

This study seeks to scrutinize CIPP model-based evaluations in guidance and counselling programs within SMK, incorporating insights from experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers. Employing a comprehensive and structured methodology, the research utilizes a mixed-method approach for data collection and analysis. This research method combines elements of both quantitative and qualitative research to address the research questions effectively (George, 2021). This approach proves advantageous and fitting for the study, as it enables the attainment of a comprehensive understanding of the impact of evaluation programs in vocational high schools by employing both quantitative and qualitative methods. The subsequent section outlines the procedural steps of the research method applied in this study:



### Data Collection

Data collection occurred at SMK Negeri 3 Banjarmasin in three stages. Initially, information on the evaluation of guidance and counselling programs in vocational schools was gathered through interviews with experts in educational research and evaluation, as well as guidance and counselling experts possessing profound knowledge in the field. The choice of interview as a data collection strategy is apt for this study, as it facilitates in-depth data retrieval from participants, unveiling their perspectives (Kerber, 2023). Additionally, interviews were chosen to obtain more reliable and valid data. Secondly, observations were conducted at various vocational schools implementing the Merdeka curriculum, with SMK Negeri 3 Banjarmasin selected for data collection. Observational data collection enables a more systematic and organized examination of the phenomenon by visually and aurally assessing the context (Smit & Onwuegbuzie, 2018). In the third phase, building upon the considerations from the second stage, views on the evaluation of the guidance and counselling program were solicited from subject teachers within the same vocational school. This stage facilitated data collection from a broader range of respondents.

### Research Instrument

The research employed an assessment instrument designed for educational research and evaluation experts, guidance and counselling experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers to evaluate the feasibility of modules. This instrument is structured to gauge evaluation aspects according to the CIPP model, encompassing clarity, adequacy, and appropriateness of evaluation. It comprises general assessment aspects, specific assessment aspects, and module material assessment aspects.

The following table presents the format of an instrument designed for evaluating the feasibility of guidance and counselling program modules.

### Table

Module Feasibility Assessment Instrument Table

NO	ASPECTS OF ASSESSMENT	CRITERIA ASSESSMENT SCORE			
		4	3	2	1
<b>NO</b>	<b>GENERAL ASPECTS OF ASSESSMENT</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
1	Clarity of the evaluation <b>concept</b> context input process product guidance and counselling program independent curriculum at vocational high school level.				
2	Clarity of <b>rational</b> evaluation of context input process product independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level.				
3	Clarity of the guidance and counselling program <b>profile</b> in the Independent curriculum at the vocational school level				
4	Clarity of <b>components</b> measured from the CIPP model of the Independent Curriculum BK program at vocational school level				
5	Clarity of <b>aspects</b> measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum BK program at vocational school level				
6	Clarity of <b>success criteria</b> as measured by the CIPP evaluation model for the Independent Curriculum BK program at vocational school level				
7	<b>Completeness of contents</b>				
8	<b>Assessment instrument</b> used				
<b>NO</b>	<b>SPECIAL ASSESSMENT ASPECTS</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
1	Clarity of evaluation <b>preparation instructions</b>				

2	Clarity of <b>implementation instructions</b> for assessing each component based on success criteria				
3	<b>Suitability of</b> evaluation model <b>material</b> with the content of the independent curriculum counselling guidance program				
4	<b>Design accuracy</b> The evaluation model chosen is the CIPP evaluation model				
5	<b>Instrument suitability</b> used to determine the success of the program				
<b>NO</b>	<b>ASPECTS OF MODULE MATERIAL ASSESSMENT</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
1	<b>Usefulness</b> evaluation model for teachers				
2	<b>Accuracy</b> choose an evaluation model with the program				
3	<b>Clarity of instructions</b> processing of instrument sheets				
4	<b>Material suitability</b> evaluation model with an independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level				
5	<b>Operational instructions</b> carrying out evaluations using the CIPP evaluation model				

The interpretation of the assessment score criteria is as follows.

- 4= Very useful/very appropriate/very feasible
- 3= Useful/Appropriate/Decent
- 2= Less useful/less appropriate/less feasible
- 1= Not useful/inappropriate/not feasible

### Participants

The research participants comprised academic-practitioner experts, with data collected from 10 guidance and counselling teachers and 10 subject teachers at SMK Negeri 3 Banjarmasin. Participant selection was conducted through purposive sampling, a non-probability sampling technique that involves selecting units possessing specific characteristics deemed essential for the sample (Nikolopoulou, 2022). This sampling technique is employed to extract substantial information from a restricted number of respondents. Nevertheless, this approach is associated with a heightened risk of researcher biases.

### Data Analysis

The collected data is subjected to quantitative analysis, employing statistical software to compute descriptive statistics, including means and standard deviations. Additionally, qualitative analysis entails categorizing findings according to emerging patterns and discoveries.

### Conceptual Framework

This study employs a conceptual framework rooted in general assessment aspects, specific assessment aspects, and module material assessment aspects to structure the findings and analyse the results.

### Perspective Evaluation

The interpretation of research findings will be conducted by taking into account the viewpoints of each group, including experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers. This approach aims to offer a comprehensive understanding of the evaluation of guidance and counselling programs in vocational schools from diverse perspectives.



## Results and Discussion

### Data Collection Results

The outcomes of the descriptive analysis of research data reveal three distinct aspects. Each aspect encompasses multiple assessed items, and the results are presented as average values (means). The expert evaluations provided by guidance and counselling teachers and subject teachers in terms of general assessment aspects (I), specific assessment aspects (II), and module material assessment aspects (III) are elucidated in the subsequent table.

#### 1. Expert Assessment

##### Table

*Descriptive Analysis Table of Expert Assessment*

ASPECT	ITEMS	ITEM AVERAGE	AVERAGE ASPECT
Aspect I	Clarity of the evaluation concept <i>context input process product</i> guidance and counselling program independent curriculum at vocational high school level.	4.0	3.96
	Clarity of rational evaluation of <i>context input process product</i> independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level.	4.0	
	Clarity of the guidance and counselling program profile in the Independent curriculum at the vocational school level	4.0	
	Clarity of components measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational school level	3.7	
	Clarity of aspects measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational school level	4.0	
	Clarity of success criteria as measured by the CIPP evaluation model for the Independent Curriculum guidance counseling program at vocational school level	4.0	
	Completeness of contents	4.0	
	Assessment instrument used	4.0	
	Clarity of evaluation preparation instructions	3.7	
	Clarity of implementation instructions for assessing each component based on success criteria	3.7	
Aspect II	Material suitability evaluation model with the content of the independent curriculum counselling guidance program	3.7	3.73
	Design accuracy the evaluation model chosen is the CIPP evaluation model	3.7	
	Instrument suitability used to determine the success of the program	4.0	
	Usefulness of the evaluation model for guidance and counselling teachers	4.0	
	Accuracy of choosing an evaluation model with the program	4.0	
Aspect III	Clarity of instructions processing of instrument sheets	4.0	4.00
	Suitability of evaluation model material with an independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level.	4.0	
	Operational instructions carrying out evaluations using the CIPP evaluation model.	4.0	
<b>Overall Average</b>		<b>3.91</b>	

Within Aspect I, it is observed that the component with the lowest mean value pertains to the clarity of the components, as assessed by the CIPP evaluation model for the Independent Curriculum BK program at the vocational school level, with an average value of 3.7. The overall average score for the general assessment aspect is 3.96, indicating that, on the whole, the items within this aspect align with highly suitable criteria.

Within Aspect II, it is evident that nearly all items have an average value of 3.7, except for one item, which attains an average of 4.0—the suitability of the instrument used to gauge the success of the program. The overall average score for the specific assessment aspect is 3.73, signifying that, overall, the items in this aspect align with highly appropriate criteria.

Within Aspect III, every item garners an average score of 4.0. The overall average score for the module material assessment aspect is 4.0, signifying that, overall, the items in this aspect align with highly suitable criteria.

In summary, the average score for the aforementioned aspects is 3.91, indicating that overall, the assessed aspects meet highly suitable criteria.

## 2. Guidance Counselling Teacher Assessment

### Table

*Descriptive Analysis for Guidance and Counselling Teacher Assessment*

ASPECT	ITEMS	ITEM AVERAGE	AVERAGE ASPECT
Aspect I	Clarity of the evaluation concept <i>context input process product</i> independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level	4.0	3.93
	Clarity of rational evaluation of <i>context input process product</i> independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level	4.0	
	Clarity of the guidance and counselling program profile in the independent curriculum at the vocational school level	3.9	
	Clarity of components measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational school level	3.9	
	Clarity of aspects measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational school level	3.9	
	Clarity of success criteria as measured by the CIPP evaluation model for the Independent Curriculum Guidance and Counselling program at vocational school level	3.8	
	Completeness of contents	3.9	
	Assessment instrument used	4.0	
	Clarity of evaluation preparation instructions	4.0	
	Clarity of implementation instructions for assessing each component based on success criteria	3.7	
Aspect II	Suitability of evaluation model material with the content of the independent curriculum guidance and counselling program	4.0	3.92
	Accuracy of the evaluation model design chosen is the CIPP evaluation model	3.9	
	Suitability of the instrument used to determine the success of the program	4.0	
	Usefulness of the evaluation model for guidance and counselling teachers	4.0	
Aspect III	Accuracy of choosing an evaluation model with the program	4.0	4.0
	Clarity of instructions for processing on instrument sheets	4.0	
	Suitability of evaluation model material with the independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level.	4.0	
	Operational instructions for carrying out evaluations using the CIPP evaluation model.	4.0	
<b>Overall Average</b>		<b>3.94</b>	

Within Aspect I, it is noted that the item with the lowest average value pertains to the clarity of the components, as assessed by the CIPP evaluation model for the Independent Curriculum BK program at the vocational school level, with an average value of 3.8. The overall average score for the general assessment aspect is 3.93, indicating that, on the whole, the items within this aspect align with highly suitable criteria.

Within Aspect II, it is observed that the item with the lowest average value concerns the clarity of the implementation instructions for each component based on the success criteria, with an average value of 3.7. The overall average score for the specific assessment aspect is 3.92, signifying that, overall, the items within this aspect align with highly suitable criteria.

Within Aspect III, it is noteworthy that every item attains an average score of 4.0. The collective average score for the module material assessment aspect is 4.0, indicating that, overall, the items within this aspect meet highly suitable criteria.

In summary, the combined average score for all the aforementioned aspects is 3.94, signifying that, overall, the assessed aspects meet the criteria of being highly appropriate.

### 3. Subject Teacher Assessment

#### Table

*Descriptive Analysis Table of Subject Teacher Assessments*

ASPECT	ITEMS	ITEM AVERAGE	AVERAGE ASPECT
Aspect I	Clarity of the evaluation <i>concept context input process product</i> guidance and counselling program of independent curriculum at vocational high school level	4.0	3.94
	Clarity of rational evaluation of <i>context input process product</i> independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level	4.0	
	Clarity of the guidance and counselling program profile in the Independent curriculum at the vocational school level	3.8	
	Clarity of components measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum BK program at vocational school level	3.9	
	Clarity of aspects measured from the CIPP evaluation model of the Independent Curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational school level	3.9	
	Clarity of success criteria as measured by the CIPP evaluation model for the Independent Curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational school level	3.9	
	Completeness of contents	4.0	
	Assessment instrument used	4.0	
	Clarity of evaluation preparation instructions	3.9	
	Clarity of implementation instructions for assessing each component based on success criteria	4.0	
Aspect II	Suitability of evaluation model material with the content of the independent curriculum guidance and counselling program	3.8	3.94
	Accuracy of the evaluation model design chosen is the CIPP evaluation model	4.0	
	Suitability of the instrument used to determine the success of the program	4.0	
	Usefulness of the evaluation model for guidance and counselling teachers	4.0	
	Accuracy of choosing an evaluation model with the program	3.9	
Aspect III	Clarity of instructions for processing on instrument sheets	3.9	3.96
	Suitability of evaluation model material with the independent curriculum guidance and counselling program at vocational high school level.	4.0	
	Operational instructions for carrying out evaluations using the CIPP evaluation model.	4.0	
<b>Overall Average</b>			<b>3.94</b>

Within Aspect I, it is observed that the item with the lowest average value pertains to the clarity of the guidance and counselling program profile in the Merdeka curriculum at the vocational school level, with an average value of 3.8. The overall average score for the general assessment aspect is 3.94, indicating that, on the whole, the items within this aspect align with highly suitable criteria.

Within Aspect II, it is noted that the item with the lowest average value concerns the suitability of the evaluation model material with the content of the independent curriculum counselling guidance program, achieving a score of 3.8. The overall average score for the specific assessment aspect is 3.94, signifying that, overall, the items within this aspect align with highly appropriate criteria.

Within Aspect III, it is noteworthy that two items exhibit the lowest average value, specifically concerning the accuracy of selecting the evaluation model with the program and the clarity of instructions for working on instrument sheets, both scoring 3.90. The overall average score for the module material assessment aspect is 3.96, indicating that, overall, the items within this aspect meet highly suitable criteria.

In summary, the combined average score for all the aforementioned aspects is 3.94, signifying that, overall, the assessed aspects meet the criteria of being highly appropriate.

## Discussion

In the examination of the evaluation of guidance and counselling programs in vocational high schools utilizing the CIPP model, three significant facets have been appraised: expert evaluation, assessment by guidance and counselling teachers, and evaluation by subject teachers. This assessment delineates the degree to which the program is embraced and deemed viable by diverse stakeholders.

### 1. Expert Assessment

The outcomes of expert evaluations concerning the assessment of this program indicate favourable results according to expert appraisals. The comprehensive assessment of this program reveals an overall average of 3.96, categorizing it within the "highly feasible" criteria (Achmad & Utami, 2023). Despite a single item registering a comparatively lower average, specifically the "clarity of measured components of the CIPP model," scoring 3.7, the overall general assessment remained highly favourable.

In the specific assessment facet, the collective average achieved 3.73, aligning with the classification of "highly suitable." Notably, one item stands out, specifically the "suitability of the instrument used to determine the success of the program" (4.0) (Afanasiev et al., 2018). The evaluation of the module material aspect also demonstrates commendable outcomes, garnering an overall average of 4.00 (Eryanto et al., 2019).

The outcomes of this program evaluation present a positive outlook on the efficacy and quality of guidance and counselling programs in vocational high schools. This aligns with prior empirical evidence, as highlighted by Whiston, Mitts, and Li (2019) emphasizing the positive aspects and effectiveness of career guidance and counselling programs. Habsy et al. (2019) study additionally underscores that program evaluation and counselling programs exert a

noteworthy influence on the enhancement of self-esteem among vocational students. Furthermore, the research findings indicate that counselling programs yield more effective outcomes, particularly for students experiencing psychological distress. Peterson, Schmid, and Kososki (2020) emphasizes the essential role of evaluation in counselling programs, noting that the impact of single-case, formative, and summative evaluation varies based on the counsellor type. This evaluation aids in comprehending the program's alignment with students' goals and needs. Consequently, the evaluation results serve as a foundation for ongoing enhancement and refinement of guidance and counselling programs in vocational high schools.

## 2. Guidance and Counselling Teacher Assessment

Guidance and counselling teachers provided a favourable evaluation of the program. The general assessment aspect attained an overall average of 3.93, aligning with the "highly satisfactory" criteria. Similar to expert evaluations, the item with the lowest mean pertained to the "clarity of the measured components of the CIPP model" (3.9). In the specific assessment aspect, the collective average was 3.92, featuring one item with an average of 4.0, specifically the "suitability of the instrument used to determine program success." The assessment of module material by guidance and counselling teachers was also notably positive, achieving an overall average of 4.00.

The positive evaluation from guidance and counselling teachers aligns with the assessments provided by experts in the relevant research, as mentioned by Achmad and Utami (2023), those who explore school collaboration as a model contributing to the success of educational transformation. Similarly, the findings of Afanasiev et al. (2018) addressing the enhancement of the effectiveness of the career guidance system for students in Russia. Furthermore, the outcomes of program evaluations gauging the academic and instructional efficacy of university lecturers, as evidenced by Ahmad and Saeed (2021), are integral components within the context of appraising guidance and counselling programs.

Prior studies, such as Wijaya et al. (2019) substantiate the outcomes of this research in this regard, asserting that guidance and counselling constitute an integral element of the education system. Proficiency in evaluating this process enhances teachers' commitment, professional ethics, and overall performance (Arfasa & Weldmeskel, 2020). The findings also suggest an elevation in perception scores among teachers and students regarding the utility of counselling and guidance programs. Nevertheless, the evaluation of these programs faces challenges due to a shortage of experts and facilities.

The favourable evaluation outcomes indicate that vocational high school guidance and counselling programs have a positive impact, encompassing both general and specific aspects. This assessment underscores the significance of employing the CIPP model for evaluating educational programs, as elucidated by Finney (2019) findings that align with the principles of confirmatory evaluation, a novel evaluation model. Additionally, this concurs with the perspective that guidance and counselling play a pivotal role in aiding students in career planning and enhancing their future success, as articulated by Savickas (2019) in the realm of career counselling. Presenting a comprehensive survey, the study underscores the affirmative assessment of guidance and counselling programs, emphasizing the escalating recognition of these initiatives over time (Wong & Yuen, 2019). It notes a sustained progression and advancement in counselling and guidance programs within schools in Hong Kong.

Hence, the favourable evaluation outcomes strongly endorse the efficacy of guidance and counselling programs in vocational high schools and affirm the utility of the CIPP model in comprehensive program evaluation. Additionally, it underscores the pivotal role played by guidance and counselling teachers in facilitating students' academic and career success.

### 3. Subject Teacher Assessment

In evaluating the guidance and counselling program in vocational high schools, subject teachers expressed positive feedback. The general assessment aspect received an overall average of 3.94, categorizing it as "very satisfactory." The item with the lowest average in this aspect pertains to the "clarity of the guidance and counselling program profile in the Independent curriculum," scoring an average of 3.8. In the specific assessment aspect, the overall average was 3.94, with all items rated falling within the "very appropriate" criteria. Regarding the assessment of module material, two items, namely "accuracy in selecting the evaluation model with the program" and "clarity of instructions for working on instrument sheets," received the lowest average of 3.90. Nonetheless, the overall average for this aspect remained at 3.96, still within the "very satisfactory" criteria.

Subject teachers' favourable evaluation of this program aligns with findings from prior research across diverse educational program evaluation contexts. An illustration of this is evident in the study conducted by [Afanasiev et al. \(2018\)](#) illustrates the inclination toward enhancing the efficacy of the career guidance system for students. This aligns with [Ahmad and Saeed \(2021\)](#) work, where they formulated and validated a tool for assessing the research and teaching performance of university academics. [Alsalamah's \(2021\)](#) study on training program evaluation and [Crothers et al. \(2020\)](#) insights into the role of guidance and counselling teachers further emphasize the significance of evaluation programs in teacher professionalism development and student support. [Liu et al. \(2022\)](#) contribution, focusing on an entrepreneurship education evaluation system, underscores the importance of program evaluation in comprehending the achievements of educational initiatives. Hence, the affirmative evaluation by subject teachers reinforces their comprehension of the success of the vocational high school guidance and counselling program.

## Conclusion

This study aims to assess the influence of guidance and counselling programs, emphasizing the role of program evaluation in vocational high schools. Employing a mixed-method approach involving interviews, observation, and discussions, the research utilizes both quantitative and qualitative analyses. The results reveal substantial positive impacts of counselling and guidance programs. Notably, the evaluation of these programs, employing the CIPP model, garnered favourable feedback from experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers. While all aspects received an overall rating of 'very decent,' a few items displayed a lower average. This underscores the potential for enhancing the quality of guidance and counselling in vocational high schools, fostering curriculum improvements, and refining the implementation of these programs.



Crucial aspects that warrant attention can be elucidated as follows:

1. The positive reception of the evaluation of the guidance and counselling program, utilizing the CIPP model, was evident among diverse stakeholders.
2. Each aspect of the program's evaluation garnered an overall "very decent" rating, signifying a favourable assessment from experts, guidance and counselling teachers, and subject teachers.
3. Nevertheless, there are specific items in the evaluation displaying a lower average, warranting attention for potential enhancements.
4. The outcomes of this assessment suggest that vocational high school guidance and counselling programs possess the potential to enhance service quality and contribute to advancements in curriculum and program implementation.

In summary, the evaluation outcomes indicate that this program exhibits a robust foundation and serves as a groundwork for subsequent enhancements and advancements.

### **Implications of the Study**

#### *Theoretical Implications*

This study holds substantial theoretical implications by revealing the positive impact of counselling and guidance programs in vocational schools, emphasizing the significance of program evaluation. The research addresses a notable gap in the literature, providing both a comprehensive exploration and expansion of the topic with significant findings. By applying the CIPP model, this study enhances the model's theoretical applicability and relevance in academic settings. Consequently, the findings offer valuable insights for research scholars and experts in the field.

#### *Practical Implications*

This study carries significant practical implications by underscoring the importance of evaluating counselling and guidance programs, thereby aiming to improve their implementation in relevant schools. The positive impact revealed in expert assessment, guidance and counselling assessment, and subject-teacher assessment provides valuable insights for staff involved. Drawing on these findings, practitioners and personnel in vocational high schools can prioritize the enhancement of these programs to maximize benefits. Additionally, the study results hold relevance for policymakers, guiding them in formulating educational and academic policies with due consideration to the significance of counselling and guidance programs.

### **Limitations of Study and Future Research Indications**

While this study yields significant results with noteworthy implications, several limitations need acknowledgment. First, there's a contextual limitation as the exploration of counselling and guidance programs is confined to vocational colleges, potentially affecting the generalizability of the findings. Future research should extend the analysis to other educational institutions for a more comprehensive understanding. Additionally, a comparative study involving high schools with different counselling and guidance models could provide valuable

insights. Second, methodological limitations arise from the use of purposive sampling, introducing potential biases. Addressing this, future studies should consider employing probability sampling techniques with randomized principles. Third, limitations are observed in the selection of dimensions for evaluating counselling and guidance programs. Future research could incorporate additional dimensions, such as students' perceptions, to further illuminate program benefits. Acknowledging these limitations, future studies should aim to broaden the scope and significance of this research topic.

### References

- Achmad, W. K. S., & Utami, U. (2023). The Synergy of the School Partnership Model in the Success of Educational Transformation. In *Proceedings of the Unima International Conference on Social Sciences and Humanities (UNICSSH 2022)* (pp. 1247-1253). Atlantis Press. [https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-35-0\\_150](https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-35-0_150)
- Afanasiev, V., Vrazhnova, M., Nechaev, M., Frolova, S., & Shypovskaia, L. (2018). Directions of Increasing the Effectiveness of Career Guidance System for Students in Russia. *Astra Salvensis*, (12), 193-209. <https://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=38646616>
- Ahmad, A., & Saeed, M. (2021). Development and Validation of Instrumentation to Assess University Academics Research and Teaching Performance in Punjab, Pakistan. *Journal of Institutional Research South East Asia*, 19(2), 119-145. [http://www.seairweb.info/journal/articles/JIRSEA\\_v19\\_n02/JIRSEA\\_v19\\_n02\\_Article06.pdf](http://www.seairweb.info/journal/articles/JIRSEA_v19_n02/JIRSEA_v19_n02_Article06.pdf)
- Alsalamah, A. (2021). *An Evaluation of the Perceptions of In-Service Training Programmes Provided for Female Head Teachers of Girls' Schools in Saudi Arabia* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Lincoln). <https://eprints.lincoln.ac.uk/id/eprint/46245>
- Arfasa, A. J., & Weldmeskel, F. M. (2020). Practices and challenges of guidance and counseling services in secondary schools. *Emerging science journal*, 4(3), 183-191. <https://doi.org/10.28991/esj-2020-01222>
- Azwar, B. (2022). The Role of The Counseling Teacher In Developing The Social Dimensions of Children With Special Needs. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 3(2), 126-138. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v3i2.238>
- Baird, B. N., & Mollen, D. (2023). *The Internship, Practicum, and Field Placement Handbook: A Guide for the Helping Professions*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003325697>
- Barber, C., Van der Vleuten, C., Leppink, J., & Chahine, S. (2020). Social accountability frameworks and their implications for medical education and program evaluation: a narrative review. *Academic Medicine*, 95(12), 1945-1954. <https://doi.org/10.1097/ACM.00000000000003731>
- Bhattacharjee, S., Mukherjee, A., Bhandari, K., & Rout, A. J. (2022). Evaluation of Multiple-Choice Questions by Item Analysis, from an Online Internal Assessment of 6<sup>th</sup> Semester Medical Students in a Rural Medical College, West Bengal. *Indian journal of community medicine : official publication of Indian Association of Preventive & Social Medicine*, 47(1), 92-95. [https://doi.org/10.4103/ijcm.ijcm\\_1156\\_21](https://doi.org/10.4103/ijcm.ijcm_1156_21)
- Cahyono, T. (2022). Management of Guidance and Counseling Services in The Merdeka Belajar Curriculum. *Bisma The Journal of Counseling*, 6(2), 265-275. <https://doi.org/10.23887/bisma.v6i2.51934>

- Crothers, L. M., Hughes, T. L., Kolbert, J. B., & Schmitt, A. J. (2020). *Theory and cases in school-based consultation: A resource for school psychologists, school counselors, special educators, and other mental health professionals*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429029974>
- Damana, I. (2022). The Counselling Teachers' Role on the Impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic With Online Learning at Lampung Buddhist Sunday School. *Jurnal Scientia*, 10(2), 281-286. <https://infor.seaninstitute.org/index.php/pendidikan/article/view/296>
- Duan, P., Niu, H., Xiang, J., & Han, C. (2022). Multi-Index and Hierarchical Comprehensive Evaluation System for Training Quality of Science and Engineering Postgraduates. *Journal of Baltic Science Education*, 21(3), 408-427. <https://doi.org/10.33225/jbse/22.21.408>
- Eryanto, H., Swaramarinda, D. R., & Nurmalasari, D. (2019). Effectiveness of entrepreneurship practice program: using CIPP program evaluation. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 22(1), 1-10. <https://www.abacademies.org/articles/effectiveness-of-entrepreneurship-practice-program-using-cipp-program-evaluation-7572.html>
- Finney, T. L. (2019). Confirmative evaluation: new CIPP evaluation model. *Journal of Modern Applied Statistical Methods*, 18(2), eP3568. <https://doi.org/10.56801/10.56801/v18.i.1065>
- Fransiska, J., Dumiyati, D., Mariam, P., Hikmah, N., & Haris, M. (2023). Education Management in the Independent Curriculum in Elementary Schools. *al-fikrah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 11(1), 78-90. <http://dx.doi.org/10.31958/jaf.v11i1.8696>
- Gallón, L. (2020). Systemic Thinking. In W. Leal Filho, A. M. Azul, L. Brandli, P. G. Özuyar, & T. Wall (Eds.), *Quality Education* (pp. 830-840). Springer International Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95870-5\\_58](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95870-5_58)
- Gardner, D. (2019). *Beyond the four levels: An evaluation model for growth and sustainability* (EER Dissertations, Wayne State University). [https://education.wayne.edu/eer\\_dissertations/gardner\\_dissertation\\_final\\_revision\\_last.pdf](https://education.wayne.edu/eer_dissertations/gardner_dissertation_final_revision_last.pdf)
- Geesa, R. L., Elam, N. P., Mayes, R. D., McConnell, K. R., & McDonald, K. M. (2019). School leaders' perceptions on comprehensive school counseling (CSC) evaluation processes: Adherence and implementation of the American School Counselor Association (ASCA) National Model. *Journal of Educational Leadership, Policy and Practice*, 34(1), 25-43. <https://doi.org/10.21307/jelpp-2019-002>
- George, T. (2021, August 13). *Mixed Methods Research | Definition, Guide & Examples*. Scribbr. <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/mixed-methods-research>
- Gullickson, A. M., King, J. A., LaVelle, J. M., & Clinton, J. M. (2019). The current state of evaluator education: A situation analysis and call to action. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 75, 20-30. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2019.02.012>
- Habsy, B. A., Hidayah, N., Lasan, B. B., Muslihata, M., & Fudholi, A. (2019). The development model of semar counselling to improve the self-esteem of vocational students with psychological distress. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning (Online)*, 14(10), 132-149. <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v14i10.10221>
- Hambali, I. (2019). Examining the relevance of Indonesian vocational high school career outcomes to the labor market. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 10(1), 133-155. <https://jsser.org/index.php/jsser/article/view/559>
- Hodges, A. L., Konicki, A. J., Talley, M. H., Bordelon, C. J., Holland, A. C., & Galin, F. S. (2019). Competency-based education in transitioning nurse practitioner students from education into practice. *Journal of the American Association of Nurse Practitioners*, 31(11), 675-682. <https://doi.org/10.1097/JXX.0000000000000327>

- Howell, P. B., Thomas, S., Sweeney, D., & Vanderhaar, J. (2019). Moving beyond schedules, testing and other duties as deemed necessary by the principal: The school counselor's role in trauma informed practices. *Middle School Journal*, 50(4), 26-34. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00940771.2019.1650548>
- Iftikhar, S., Fu, Y., Naureen, S., Cao, Y., & Zhou, C. (2022). Cascading of teachers training at higher education in Pakistan: An evaluation of a faculty professional development program. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 94, 102130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2022.102130>
- Indriani, F. I., & Holisah, H. (2022). Evaluation of the implementation of the Teaching Campus program in elementary school: A phenomenological approach. *Jurnal Penelitian dan Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 26(2), 137-159. <http://dx.doi.org/10.21831/pep.v26i2.46834>
- Jackson, D., & Tomlinson, M. (2020). Investigating the relationship between career planning, proactivity and employability perceptions among higher education students in uncertain labour market conditions. *Higher education*, 80(3), 435-455. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-019-00490-5>
- Kerber, U. (2023, Sep 7). *What are the advantages and challenges of using interviews in qualitative research?* LinkedIn. <https://www.linkedin.com/advice/0/what-advantages-challenges-using-interviews-qualitative>
- Keumala, E., Nurihsan, J., & Budiamin, A. (2018). The development of career learning program with modeling technique to improve student career awareness. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 1(2), 53-61. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v1i2.270>
- Küçükkayhan, S., & Adigüzel, O. C. (2021). An Evaluation of Vocational Open Education High School Programs in Hammond Program Evaluation Model. *Anadolu Journal of Educational Sciences International (AJESI)*, 11(2), 704-736. <https://doi.org/10.18039/ajesi.801712>
- Kurganovna, K. D., Abdusalomovna, A. S., Sabirovna, A. N., & Gafurovna, A. S. (2022). The Use Of Interactive Methods And Literary Lessons And High School Education. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 6(10), 4328-4332. <https://www.journalppw.com/index.php/jpsp/article/view/14497>
- Kuzu, E., Özkan, Y., & Bada, E. (2021). An EFL program evaluation: a case from Turkey. *The Reading Matrix: An International Online Journal*, 21(1), 94-106. <https://readingmatrix.com/files/24-3712a134.pdf>
- Lane, M., Moore, A., Hooper, L., Menzies, V., Cooper, B., Shaw, N., & Rueckert, C. (2019). Dimensions of student success: a framework for defining and evaluating support for learning in higher education. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 38(5), 954-968. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2019.1615418>
- Leal Filho, W., Marisa Azul, A., Brandli, L., Gökçin Özüyar, P., & Wall, T. (2020). *Sustainable cities and communities*. Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95717-3>
- Liu, X., Wang, X., & Feng, N. (2022). Construction and Application of Evaluation Index System of Entrepreneurship Education. *Open Access Library Journal*, 9(8), 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.4236/oalib.1109107>
- Lowery, K., Quick, M., Boyland, L., Geesa, R. L., & Mayes, R. D. (2018). " It Wasn't Mentioned and Should Have Been": Principals' Preparation to Support Comprehensive School Counseling. *Journal of Organizational and Educational Leadership*, 3(2), 3. <https://digitalcommons.gardner-webb.edu/joel/vol3/iss2/3>
- Madon, Z., Surif, M., Samah, A. A., Muhammad, M., & Sulaiman, A. H. (2021). Issues and challenges in evaluating community impact study on knowledge transfer program: Researchers' reflection. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 11(15), 229-244. <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v11-i15/10649>

- Martaningsih, S. T., & Istiyono, E. (2019). Evaluation Model of Career Counseling Program in Vocational High School. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, 8(2), 318-329. <https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v8i2.14986>
- Mastur, M. (2023). Strategy The principal's Leadership Style in Implementing "Merdeka Belajar" in Schools. *Kelola: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 10(1), 10-21. <https://doi.org/10.24246/j.jk.2023.v10.i1.p10-21>
- McGrath, R. E., Han, H., Brown, M., & Meindl, P. (2022). What does character education mean to character education experts? A prototype analysis of expert opinions. *Journal of Moral Education*, 51(2), 219-237. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2020.1862073>
- Mertens, D. M., & Wilson, A. T. (2018). *Program evaluation theory and practice*. Guilford Publications. <https://www.guilford.com/books/Program-Evaluation-Theory-and-Practice/Mertens-Wilson/9781462532759>
- Mohammad, F., Andi, S. M., & Karyanti, K. (2022). Evaluation of the CSE-UCLA model on the performance of school counselor in Indonesia. *Prospects for Science and Education*, 2(56), 561-572. <https://doi.org/10.32744/pse.2022.2.33>
- Mohanna, K., Wall, D., Cottrell, E., & Chambers, R. (2023). *Teaching made easy: a manual for health professionals*. CRC Press. <https://doi.org/10.1201/9781003352532>
- Morris, T. H. (2019). Self-directed learning: A fundamental competence in a rapidly changing world. *International Review of Education*, 65(4), 633-653. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-019-09793-2>
- Mpuangnan, K. N. (2021). *Evaluation of Basic Teacher Education Curriculum in Ghana* (Doctoral dissertation, Maharaja Sayajirao University of Baroda (India)). <https://www.proquest.com/openview/2aa3e99b312ac2c7ceee71fc2410355c>
- Mustafiyanti, M., Putri, M. P., Muyassaroh, M., Noviani, D., & Dylan, M. (2023). A Form of Independent Curriculum, an Overview of Independent Learning at State Elementary School 05 Gelumbang Muaraenim. *Pengabdian: Jurnal Abdimas*, 1(2), 82-96. <https://doi.org/10.55849/abdimas.v1i2.185>
- Nikolopoulou, K. (2022, August 11). *What Is Purposive Sampling? | Definition & Examples*. Scribbr. <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/purposive-sampling>
- Nurjanah, N., Rizal, F., Yulastri, A., Lizar, Y., & Hayadi, B. (2019). Evaluation of Program Implementation in Industrial Work Practices of State Vocational High School 3 of Students in Batam. In *Proceedings of 1st Workshop on Environmental Science, Society, and Technology, WESTECH 2018, December 8th, 2018, Medan, Indonesia*. EAI. <http://dx.doi.org/10.4108/eai.8-12-2018.2284019>
- Nursyamsiah, N., Bunyamin, B., & Muljono, H. (2023). Evaluation of the School Principals Situational Leadership in Improving Teacher Performance. *International Journal of Educational Management and Technology (IJEMT)*, 1(1), 17-24. <https://doi.org/10.61398/ijemt.v1i1.16>
- Oktapiani, M., Sutiono, S., & Choli, I. (2022). Evaluation of the Implementation of the Kampus Mengajar Program Based on the CIPP Model. *Ta'dib: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 27(2), 132-145. <https://doi.org/10.19109/td.v27i2.14644>
- Peterson, C. H., Schmid, K., & Kososki, R. (2020). A national survey of counselors' use of five types of program evaluation. *Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation*, 11(2), 71-87. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21501378.2019.1678017>
- Ponsiglione, A. M., Amato, F., Cozzolino, S., Russo, G., Romano, M., & Improta, G. (2022). A hybrid analytic hierarchy process and likert scale approach for the quality assessment of medical education programs. *Mathematics*, 10(9), 1426. <https://doi.org/10.3390/math10091426>

- Pordelan, N., & Hosseinian, S. (2022). Design and development of the online career counselling: a tool for better career decision-making. *Behaviour & Information Technology*, 41(1), 118-138. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0144929X.2020.1795262>
- Poth, C. N., Searle, M., Aquilina, A. M., Ge, J., & Elder, A. (2020). Assessing competency-based evaluation course impacts: A mixed methods case study. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 79, 101789. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2020.101789>
- Pramono, R. (2021). The Evaluation of Narada Cup School Sport Program Using CIPP Evaluation Model. *Jurnal Pendidikan Jasmani dan Olahraga*, 5(1), 81-86. <https://doi.org/10.17509/jpjo.v5i1.23516>
- Pujiastuti, P., Herwin, H., & Firdaus, F. M. (2021). Thematic Learning during the Pandemic: CIPP Evaluation Study. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 16(6), 2970-3980. <https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v16i6.6481>
- Regmi, K., & Jones, L. (2020). A systematic review of the factors-enablers and barriers-affecting e-learning in health sciences education. *BMC medical education*, 20(1), 91. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-020-02007-6>
- Sankaran, S., & Saad, N. (2022). Evaluating the Bachelor of Education Program Based on the Context, Input, Process, and Product Model. *Frontiers in Education*, 7, 924374. <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2022.924374>
- Saptono, B., Herwin, H., & Firmansyah, F. (2021). Web-Based Evaluation for Teacher Professional Program: Design and Development Studies. *World Journal on Educational Technology: Current Issues*, 13(4), 672-683. <https://doi.org/10.18844/wjet.v13i4.6253>
- Savickas, M. (2019). *Career Counseling*. American Psychological Association. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0000105-000>
- Shi, J., Narasuman, S., Luaran, J. E., Xiang, J., & Li, W. (2023). Evaluation Model for Virtue Education in Business English Courses. *Wisdom*, 2(26), 102-117. <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/evaluation-model-for-virtue-education-in-business-english-courses>
- Shu, L., Yanbin, Z., Ka, C., Zakariah, S. H., & Ali, N. M. (2023). The Establishment of Career Development and Employment Guidance Course Evaluation System based on CIPP Model. *Journal of Technology and Humanities*, 4(1), 41-48. <https://doi.org/10.53797/jthkss.v4i1.5.2023>
- Smit, B., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2018). Observations in qualitative inquiry: When what you see is not what you see. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 17(1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406918816766>
- Sudarwan, E., Edy, R., & Tola, B. (2021). New Student Admission System for Community Development Program in Bandar Lampung City (Model Evaluation Cipp and Adversary). *Review of International Geographical Education Online*, 11(5). <https://rigeo.org/menu-script/index.php/rigeo/article/view/858>
- Sugiyono, S., & Muslikah, M. (2018). Evaluation Models of Guidance and Counseling Service Based CIPP in Senior High School. In *4th International Conference on Early Childhood Education. Semarang Early Childhood Research and Education Talks (SECRET 2018)* (pp. 242-249). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/secret-18.2018.41>
- Sullivan, L., Carter, J. E., Houle, J., Ding, K., Hautmann, A., & Yang, J. (2023). Evaluation of a resilience training program for college student-athletes: A pilot study. *Journal of American college health*, 71(1), 310-317. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07448481.2021.1891083>
- Supriyanto, A., Hartini, S., Irdasari, W. N., Miftahul, A., Oktapiana, S., & Mumpuni, S. D. (2020). Teacher professional quality: Counselling services with technology in Pandemic Covid-19. *Counsellia: Jurnal Bimbingan dan Konseling*, 10(2), 176-189. <http://doi.org/10.25273/counsellia.v10i2.7768>



- Supriyanto, A., Hartini, S., Syamsudin, S., & Sutoyo, A. (2019). Indicators of professional competencies in research of Guidance and Counseling Teachers. *Counsellia: Jurnal Bimbingan dan Konseling*, 9(1), 53-64. <http://doi.org/10.25273/counsellia.v9i1.3927>
- Susatya, E., Santosa, B., Andriyani, A., & Ariyani, D. (2021). Evaluating the implementation of the character education strengthening program of vocational high schools in Yogyakarta City. *Research and Evaluation in Education*, 7(1), 23-34. <http://dx.doi.org/10.21831/reid.v7i1.38029>
- Taridi, M., Risnita, Yaakob, M. F. M., & Khairani, M. (2023). An evaluative study for communicative language teaching (CLT) on online teaching and learning in higher education: Indonesian and Malaysian university context. *Education and Information Technologies*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-023-12221-6>
- Utakrit, N., & Siripanich, A. (2018). An Integration Of Programme Evaluation And Action Research On A Preliminary Professional Development Training In Vocational School. *ABAC Journal*, 38(2), 6-20. <http://www.assumptionjournal.au.edu/index.php/abaajournal/article/view/3558>
- Whiston, S. C., Mitts, N. G., & Li, Y. (2019). Evaluation of Career Guidance Programs. In J. A. Athanassou & H. N. Perera (Eds.), *International Handbook of Career Guidance* (pp. 815-834). Springer International Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-25153-6\\_38](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-25153-6_38)
- Wijaya, R., Husniah, W., Taherong, R., Nuryadin, C., Hanifa, L., & Ichsani, N. (2019). Professional competency levels teacher guidance and counseling/counselor school. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 235(1), 012105. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/235/1/012105>
- Wilkins, E. L. (2022). *A Program Evaluation of the Marilyn Friend Co-Teaching Models* (Doctoral dissertation, Gardner-Webb University). <https://digitalcommons.gardner-webb.edu/education-dissertations/106>
- Winaryati, E., & Hidayat, M. T. (2020). Conceptual Framework of Evaluation Model on 4 CS-Based Learning Supervision. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 19(8), 173-193. <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.8.10>
- Wong, L. P., & Yuen, M. (2019). Career guidance and counseling in secondary schools in Hong Kong: A historical overview. *Journal of Asia Pacific Counseling*, 9(1), 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.18401.2019.9.1.2>
- Zheng, M., Chu, C.-C., Wu, Y. J., & Gou, W. (2018). The mapping of on-line learning to flipped classroom: Small private online course. *Sustainability*, 10(3), 748. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10030748>