

Eurasian Journal of Educational Research www.ejer.com.tr



A Study of Mediating Role of Industry Curriculum on Vocational Education and Apprenticeship Method of Learning

Anas Ratib Alsoud¹, Omar Abdeljaber², Mohd Shukri Ab Yajid³, Johar MGM^{4*}, Sultan Al-masaeed⁵, Shakeerah Mohd Shukri⁶.

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Article History: Received: 10 April 2021 Received in revised form: 17 October 2021 Accepted: 12 November 2021 DOI: 10.14689/ejer.2021.96.17 Keuwords

vocational education, apprenticeship, employability, labour market, higher education, industry curriculum

Vocational education and apprenticeships are designed to bridge industry needs and graduate capabilities. It is the possibility of students finding work. Training and apprenticeship are also important factors. This study has shown a beneficial association between vocational education and training and employment. These initiatives and plans attempt to increase enrollment rates, increase female labour force participation, increase economic growth, and decrease poverty and unemployment. However, even though the pandemic has slowed the implementation of the Jordanian government's strategies and plans by at least two years, there is enough hope in the latent potential of literal youth to put Jordan's economy back on track. Employability of graduates can be greatly boosted via vocational

education and training and apprenticeship models of learning. As a result, Jordan will see less poverty and unemployment. The data were collected using a questionnaire and analyzed using SPSS and Smart PLS. As for apprenticeships, they are linked to employability but not to the industrial curriculum.

© 2021 Ani Publishing Ltd. All rights reserved.

⁵ AL-Ahliyya Amman University, Hourani Center for Applied Scientific Research,

¹ AL-Ahliyya Amman University, Hourani Center for Applied Scientific Research, Email: <u>a.alsoud@ammanu.edu.jo</u> ² AL-Ahliyya Amman University, Hourani Center for Applied Scientific Research,

Email: o.abdeljaber@ammanu.edu.jo

³ Management and Science University, Email: <u>shukri@msu.edu.my</u>, ORCID: 0000-0001-5688-4392

^{4*} Management and Science University, Email: <u>mdgapar@msu.edu.my</u>, ORCID: 0000-0001-7986-3834

Email: s.masaeed@ammanu.edu.jo

⁶ Management and Science University, Email: <u>shakeerah@msu.edu.my</u>, ORCID: 0000-0002-1075-635X

Introduction

This study aims to close the gap between vocational education and industrial curriculums in Jordan by adopting the apprenticeship way of learning. Jordan is experiencing an unparalleled unemployment crisis, with jobless rates of 61.5 per cent for those aged 20-14 and 36.5 per cent for those aged 25-29. While unemployment has increased globally due to the pandemic, it is the youth who have been hardest hit during these trying times (Mahmut & SUNA, 2020). Jordan's population is approaching 10.5 million, according to the United Nations (UN), with a growth rate of roughly 2.7 per cent and a literacy rate among teenagers aged 15-24 of up to 99 percent. These characteristics imply that youth have stayed unemployed despite a high literacy rate. Additionally, this paper aims to identify the relevance of apprenticeship learning models in promoting adolescent employability (Grytnes et al., 2018).

Various researchers and organisations such as the European Commission, UNESCO, the International Labour Organization, and the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) have characterised vocational education in various ways (Grytnes et al., 2018). The most thorough conceptualization of Vocational Education and Training (VET) originated with, who recognised four dimensions: epistemology, teleology, hierarchy, and pragmatics. Whereas epistemology specifies the method of learning, teleology defines the aim, hierarchical defines vocational training within the context of an occupation categorization, and pragmatic encompasses whatever is considered normal at the time. Similarly, Eichhorst et al. (2015) attempted to separate three characteristics of vocational education and training, including general purpose, underlying beliefs, and future ambitions (Cocks et al., 2015). These can be summarised in terms of three perspectives: epistemological, educational, socioeconomic, or labour market.

Indeed, there has been a long-running disagreement between the apprenticeship and academic education models. Former is significantly more valuable than latter in practical or skill-based disciplines such as medicine (Forster et al., 2016). Apprenticeships are based on the old notion that learning by observing and doing is more effective than reading. Teachers are supposed to train pupils through practical examples in the apprenticeship model of education. This model contributes to establishing a link between academic knowledge and industry curriculum (Rageth & Renold, 2020). In retrospect, this helps with employment.

Industry Curriculum refers to the abilities necessary to succeed in any segment of an industry (Korber & Oesch, 2019). According to Shahroom and Hussin (2018), the world is currently experiencing the fourth industrial revolution, termed Industrial Revolution 4.0. This data-driven transformation necessitates a new set of abilities, and the apprenticeship model of education is evolving as the digital world necessitates quicker, more energy-efficient equipment (Shahroom & Hussin, 2018). However, even if there is enormous potential for growth in this digital age, the number of people with the necessary skills is quite limited. Even Jeff Bezos has stated that there are insufficiently skilled individuals to promote the argument for the digital revolution (Hampf & Woessmann, 2017). This is because traditional schooling has failed to develop individuals with the necessary abilities. This can be overcome through vocational education and apprenticeship models of learning, as this paper will demonstrate in the case of Jordan (Wheelahan & Moodie, 2017).

According to Al-Zyoud (2015), Jordan's Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is organised into five levels: primary (ISCED 1), lower secondary (ISCED 2), upper secondary (ISCED 3), post-secondary (ISCED 4), and tertiary (ISCED 5). (ISCED 5-8). Six years of primary education are required, whereas four years of secondary education are required. Students have three options following lower secondary education: Upper Secondary (Academic) for two years, Upper Secondary (Vocational + Academic) for two years, or Vocational Training for three to two years. To continue their education, pupils must pass the Tawjihi National General Secondary Exams (Alsaâ, 2016). The labour market is primarily composed of individuals who have completed Vocational Training Programs or Technical Diplomas. Technical and diploma-level courses are classified as post-secondary education. Finally, the tertiary level of education consists of bachelor's programmes lasting four to six years, master's programmes lasting two years, and doctoral programmes lasting three to five years. Similarly, vocational and technical training at the expert level is provided for up to two to three years at the tertiary level. With a sketch of Jordan's educational system in hand, we can conduct a qualitative analysis of the government's efforts to combat the shadow of unemployment (Barcucci et al., 2017).

Jordan's primary oversight entity for vocational education was formed in 1976 under Temporary Law No. 35 as the Vocational Training Corporation (VTC). The mission of this school is to ensure that individuals continue to develop and flourish throughout their occupational and academic lives. In other words, it is in charge of education, course design, administrative and behavioural components of the labour market (Alsaâ, 2016).

Jordan's government published the National Employment Strategy 2011-2020 in 2010, with its primary objectives grouped into three categories: short-term, medium-term, and long-term. The short-term focus was on absorbing unemployment until 2014. The medium-term focus was on skill-based learning and the expansion of Small to Medium-Sized Enterprises (SMEs). The long-term focus was on reforming the economy and increasing productivity (Caputo et al., 2016). Additionally, it sought to raise women's low labour force participation and address inadequacies in forming a healthy institutional environment and labour intuition follow-through. Regrettably, the Jordanian government was unable to achieve its aims, and the situation was exacerbated in 2020 by COVID (Al-Balas et al., 2020).

Jordan's National Employment – Technical and Vocational Education and Training (E-TVET) Strategy was adopted in 2014. It ran from 2014 to 2020. It listed five critical components for furthering the cause of vocational education. They included governance, performance monitoring, appropriate education and training to promote employability and inclusion, and a sustainable and effective finance structure (Barrera-Osorio et al., 2020). Finally, the government implemented the Ministry of Education – Strategy Plan in 2018. (2018-2022). The four-year plan focused on three critical areas: improving management skills, expanding access, and improving quality. This plan is designed with gender equality and the closing of the gender gap in the labour force (Barrera-Osorio et al., 2020).

A few questions must be addressed to adequately understand the mediating role of vocational education and the apprenticeship model of learning in Jordan's industry curriculum. Is there a mismatch between graduates of higher education and market requirements? Is employment the ultimate purpose of education? Is employability a critical factor for post-secondary institutions? And are the worries above shared by families and graduates? Regrettably, the majority of the questions have negative answers. The primary impediments to skill-oriented education are that graduates are underprepared and unmotivated, that there are few public-private partnerships, and a lack of a holistic approach to resolving this issue (Barrera-Osorio et al., 2020).

To accomplish the goal of vocational education, the Jordanian government must focus more on apprenticeships (Billett, 2016). For instance, teacher training is vital to ensure welltrained and devoted employees. They possess the necessary talents that enable them to transmit knowledge in the most practical manner possible.

Another critical component is private public partnerships; it has been discovered that when private public partnerships exist, workers are more skilled and vocational training is more skilled. If this occurs in Jordan, employment rates could fall considerably due to graduates' increased employability (Bieler et al., 2019). Finally, the government's lack of a holistic approach complicates matters for unemployed kids. A well-directed, well-planned, and multidimensional effort is required in Jordan to boost graduates' employability. Recent efforts have resulted in the establishment of TVSDC and a network of sector skills councils (SSCs), both of which have the potential to be useful in this regard (Billett, 2016). Apprenticeship education focuses on career management services, which implies that as workers enter their professions, they must grow with them, as most fields of employment do. And they must educate themselves in accordance with the times. For instance, workers who possess basic Microsoft Word abilities improve their employability in the digital age.

According to Fernández (2015), a high-quality apprenticeship model of education consists of seven critical components: shared responsibility between government, employers, and labour unions, high-quality vocational schools, effective entry, effective strategies and policies, legal protections, and entrepreneurship.Barrera-Osorio et al. (2020) assert that shared responsibility between governments, employers, and labour unions

encourages active participation by all stakeholders, thereby increasing the effectiveness of apprenticeship and, as a result, making industry curriculum a reality and increasing workers' employability, thereby reducing unemployment. Vocational training institutions must be up to date. They must have cutting-edge technology, teachers skilled in cutting-edge approaches, opportunities for research, and an environment that fosters growth and development (Cahuc & Hervelin, 2020). As Cahuc and Hervelin (2020) concluded, such an environment effectively bridges the divide between industry and education. As a result, it is a very effective method of increasing employability and lowering unemployment.

Indeed, all vocational education and training schools should ensure that admissions are open to all. They should admit not only graduates and labourers, but also individuals who have been misplaced. Because it is the dislocated adults who are most vulnerable to the unemployment axe (Alrabba, 2017). As a result, both employability and unemployment have a significant impact in this regard. Jordan, in particular, is a victim. Its youth are largely misdirected in their careers. As previously stated, out of Jordan's eleven economic sectors, the Information and Computer Technology industry is the second least utilised.

Given that this sector requires advanced skill sets and Jordan's education system has failed to produce educated graduates, it's unsurprising that unemployment among the age group 20-24 is as high as 61%. (Assaad & Krafft, 2016). What is required is that the government invest in training Jordanian youth in information technology. Only then would it be possible to bring down the nation's unparalleled unemployment rate. Additionally, manufacturing is the third largest sector of the Jordanian economy, but it will not remain so long as machines continue to supplant human labour at record rates. As a result, individuals must acquire ICT skills. Another issue that could help boost the institution's apprenticeship in Jordan is legislative protection. If it is consistent with national legislation and contractualizes apprenticeship, learners will complete their training. Additionally, it will improve employability.

To boost employability, Vocational Training and Apprenticeship models of learning must act as a bridge between school and industry, strengthening Jordan's labour force. Jordan's young population possesses enormous latent potential and can jump-start the Jordanian economy. To do this, all stakeholders must join together and collaborate to map an inclusive, futuristic, and opportunity-filled future. Issues such as insufficient female labour force participation, inadequately prepared trainers and teachers, and out-of-date subject matter and methodologies must be addressed.

This paper will outline how medication is made available and how the ideal of a progressive Jordan becomes a reality. Apprenticeship and vocational education are, without a doubt, inextricably related to industrial curriculum. They also have a direct effect on graduates' employability. Jordan's population is youthful compared to its Middle Eastern neighbours, and hence has the unique ability to grow and outperform them. This can only occur if youth potential is fully realised through academic and vocational training. Jordan's service industry accounts for less than 1% of GDP and has enormous growth potential, particularly in the current digital age, when working from home has become the

new standard. This can also help increase women's participation in the service industry, typically closed to them due to cultural barriers.

Literature Review

Vocational Education and Industry Curriculum

There has been little research undertaken on industry curricula and vocational education. Those who attempted to analyse their relationship more closely discovered that both have a relatively favourable relationship, with the former complementing the latter. According to Hodge (2016), because industrial requirements are primarily concerned with understanding practical skills and their application, vocational education is deemed more aligned with industrial requirements. Because vocational learning models entail a direct study of various instruments and their use in industrial life, they are generally close to industry and thus to the industry curriculum (Ellahi et al., 2019).

On the other hand, Foley (2004a) claimed that industrial education required a blend of characteristics associated with higher education graduates and the skills associated with vocational education graduates. They claimed that because the industry requires more than practical abilities, it also needs innovative individuals and has a presentable personality; so, an individual should possess both sets of characteristics. Jones (2018), on the other hand, stated that the labour force is primarily composed of skilled workers. Those who are more efficient in running the industry's foundations. In comparison to higher education, vocational education is more tightly related to industrial curriculum. As a result, the following theory is advanced (Lipińska, 2021):

H1: Vocational education has a significant positive relationship with industry curriculum

Apprenticeship model of learning and industry curriculum

In several European countries, the apprenticeship model is in place, and apprentices receive formal certifications and diplomas upon completion of the necessary period; however, this is not the case in developing countries. This is why most apprenticeship literature is typically based on western patterns and so lacks the depth necessary to be applicable in other nations. However, it is reasonable to presume its reliability and applicability based on the facts. Additionally, it can be applied to emerging countries such as Jordan to determine its viability (Kuehn, 2017). Jacoby and Lerman (2019) noted that, while the extent of its application in underdeveloped nations is unknown, it is strongly advised to try a proven approach in countries suffering to locate qualified labour (KURNIAWAN et al., 2021; MAGALLANES et al., 2021).

Apprenticeships can provide many disadvantaged persons with the opportunity to work in a formal work environment. They may find it easier to pick up any necessary skills while under supervision, which will benefit them in the long term. Additionally, due to their presence under the direct supervision of a formal working environment, they are more knowledgeable about the business and thus find it easier to obtain a job and then settle in the environment (Kuehn, 2017). The following hypothesis is drawn from this (Ilyas & Afzal, 2021; Kim, 2021).

H2: Apprenticeship method of learning has a significant positive relationship with industry curriculum

Industry Curriculum and Employability

With the advent of new difficulties in the twenty-first century, it has become critical for educators to develop a curriculum and reach a consensus on its application. Ito and Kawazoe (2015) discussed the growing demand for universities to revise their curricula to make them more relevant to growing industrial needs. This phenomena has gained increasing prominence as the number of graduates exceeds the number of available jobs, resulting in an employability crisis. Chua et al. (2017) did a study throughout Europe to determine whether the current academic curriculum meets students' employability and labour market needs. It was found that there is a striking discrepancy between labour market needs and requirements and curriculum requirements. Teng et al. (2019) argued for introducing a curriculum that is more relevant to industrial demands and has a direct connection to industry (Melhem, 2021; Nguyen et al., 2021).

Another study conducted by Sa-Nguanmanasak and Khampirat (2019) discovered that industrial curricula are more effective at meeting market needs, which increases students' employability. The changing work environment in the modern world necessitates a workforce that does not require formal training before official charge, but rather one that is trained before hands and capable of operating successfully in the market. There is a need to integrate such interventions into higher education to familiarise students with industrial demands and teach them the necessary skills for industry. These programmes can motivate students to become more engaged in the practical aspects of their work and become more efficient in their skill development. Collet et al. (2015) discovered that conducting such interventions and implementing such programmes decreases the rate of dropout from universities and colleges. They develop a greater sense of urgency and commitment to the severity of their work and study, and therefore the divide between academia and industry narrows (Heuser, 2021).

According to a Malaysian study, to develop human capital, a major emphasis on the holistic development of students is necessary. Comparing vocational and higher education, it was argued that while vocational education places a premium on practical knowledge, higher education places a premium on theoretical work and personality development. To produce a skilled workforce, it is necessary to have a curriculum that combines both types of curricula and focuses on both practical and theoretical knowledge and personality development. Such a curriculum will catalyze recruiters and job seekers (Sa-Nguanmanasak & Khampirat, 2019).

Ishengoma and Vaaland (2016) concur with the initial study, suggesting that the curriculum should be completely revised to address industry demands in a broader sense. It was emphasized that while having high abilities alone does not meet labour market criteria, the job applicant should possess a combination of the aforementioned qualities, which are directly related to curriculum and other characteristics. As a result, it is reasonable to suggest that

H3: Industry curriculum has a significant positive relationship with employability

Vocational Education and Employability

Vocational education is a type of education in which individuals are taught instructional courses emphasizing job-related skills. Vocational education is unidirectional and focuses exclusively on the one skill that the student will utilize throughout his professional career. When getting work in existing labour models, skills are paramount. Without these, the bulk of people will remain unemployed. Vocational education has become critical due to its skills-based concept in this context. Mahmut and SUNA (2020) claim that job seekers who have the essential abilities expressed confidence in themselves and expressed happiness with their work. Additionally, companies are pleased with the personnel and their job.

According to Lice and Sloka (2019), vocational education is critical for skill development and increases employability prospects. Students' practical skills during their certification **programme** motivate them to pursue employment. In contrast to theoretical education, students receive direct instruction in the one skill they believe will aid them in obtaining work. By drawing this analogy,Lice and Sloka (2019) argued that it is simpler for students who lack research opportunities and develop new research models to acquire the skills necessary for future success.

Komariah (2015) states that students in vocational centers spend hours in practical workshops gaining the skills necessary to obtain good jobs. Additionally, this study **discovered** that individuals with vocational training, as opposed to those with a higher degree, settle more easily because it is easier for them to find their dream job placements. In addition to theoretical information, students learn how to operate advanced equipment essential for a particular trade or work. As a result, once they find suitable employment, they will have the necessary experience to begin immediately. In contrast to others, they do not require a follow-up period to become familiar with the mechanisms at work (Komariah, 2015).

Sulaiman and Ambotang (2017) reported that employers favoured people with skills in all labour markets. Prior learning experience is critical to production managers, and they reward those who possess it before starting work. This translates into effective business success at the individual and corporate levels. Higgs et al. (2019) conducted a similar study and discovered that even those with a rudimentary understanding of commercial instruments and grass-roots activities were highly employable. Additionally, it is noticed that persons with vocational education face less barriers to work than others. While students enrolled in higher education programmes may have to wait months, if not years, to find a career that fits their interests, students in vocational institutions typically have an easier time finding work. They have relevant experience to include on their resumes because they have first-hand knowledge of industrial tools. This ultimately differentiates them from the competition.

Munishi and Emmanuel (2016) discovered that the hands-on experience students get throughout their education in the form of practical learning and internships aids students in acquiring the necessary experience that recruiters seek in a candidate. This eventually results in their recruitment. Additionally, it was noted that students with practical education had stronger ties to industry professionals and were more aware of emerging models. This intimate relationship kept them informed and, as a result, informed them (Sulaiman & Ambotang, 2017). Another significant finding was the link between teachers and students. Students at vocational schools developed a more personal relationship with their teachers, who assisted them in locating suitable jobs (Munishi & Emmanuel, 2016).

The **initial** step for those interested in enhancing their employability abilities should be to pursue vocational education alternatives. These abilities can assist students in developing the tactics and strategies necessary for success in this field of work. Employers may be confident that applicants recruited from a reputable school already possess the necessary expertise and training to begin working immediately. As a result, it is possible to claim that

H4: Vocational Education has a significant positive relationship with employability

Apprenticeship model of learning and employability

Apprenticeship as a system is a method of learning under the supervision of a qualified expert who introduces the apprentice to practical work through hands-on experience. Occasionally, if the supervisor feels it appropriate, he may introduce the apprentice to courses unrelated to the practical work but ultimately complement it. Apprenticeships were rather widespread during the enlightenment period and have produced some of the best-educated minds over the centuries. Throughout the apprenticeship, the apprentice delivers labour to the supervisor for an agreed-upon period, which results in a diploma or certificate upon completion of the services.

According to analysts, graduate positions are falling globally in the age of E-Commerce, creating an incentive for people interested in pursuing an apprenticeship. In terms of employability, it is evident that those with degrees have a greater chance of finding work, but they lack experience, which offers those with apprenticeships an advantage. According to Mindham and Schultz (2019), while graduates are more respected in today's academic system for their breadth of research and development, apprentices are better equipped with knowledge and more likely to obtain jobs that require technical experience, making them more likely to be recruited than graduates.

Various job profiles need professional skill with a particular instrument or tool; in these cases, it is extremely beneficial for apprentices to obtain employment eventually due to their comparably superior comprehension.Daly (2017) discusses how employers are more receptive to an apprentice. First, because apprentices are more exposed to the working environment and the mechanisms that govern how a business operates, they easily adjust to any work situation. Second, apprentices receive both on-the-job and off-the-job training, which helps decide their capacity to multitask, critical in a professional environment. Thirdly, they are not restricted to a specific job role as an employee because of their multitasking abilities. Keeping the preceding discussion in mind, the following ideas can be presented.

H5: Apprenticeship method of learning has a significant positive relationship with employability

H6: Industry curriculum significantly mediates between vocational education and employability

H7: Industry curriculum significantly mediates between apprenticeship method of learning and employability

Research Framework



Research Methodology

The study was done in Jordan, to determine the relationship between vocational education (VE), apprenticeship models of learning (AML), industrial curricula (IC), and employability (E). This study used VE and AML as independent factors, while their effect on E was used as the dependent variable. In this case, IC served as a liaison between VE and E and AML and E. The data collection technique used was the questionnaire. 500 respondents were contacted and sent questionnaires as part of the study. 470 people returned questionnaires out of 500. For the record of secrecy, the respondent was assured that their information would remain private and would not be made public. The responders included vocational education, higher education, and human resources professionals.

The questionnaire contained 37 questions and was divided into two sections. The first section featured socio-demographic data, whereas the second section contained 32 items, eight for each variable, which was derived from (Foley, 2004b), (Guilbert et al., 2016), (Fernández, 2015) and (Ellahi et al., 2019). The questionnaire employed a five-point Likert scale, with questions ranging from strongly disagree to strongly agree, or from 1 to 5. The data were analysed using the PLS-SEM approach.

Results

A convergent validity test was used to ascertain the link. The connection between the specified variables was determined to be positive for this study. For the analysis, variables were classified according to their alpha and composite reliability. The alpha and composite reliability coefficients for the selected variables were both greater than 0.7, which corroborated our findings. Additionally, AVE values greater than 0.5 provided evidence for this association. The table below summarises the convergent validity test results.

Anas Ratib Alsoud - Omar Abdeljaber - Mohd Shukri Ab Yajid - Johar MGM - Sultan Al-masaeed -	
Shakeerah Mohd Shukri / Eurasian Journal of Educational Research 96 (2021) 302-320	

Table 1

Convergent	Validity
------------	----------

	Items	Loadings	Cronbach's Alpha	a rho_A	Composite Reliability	AVE
Apprenticeship	AML1	0.822	0.912	0.915	0.929	0.620
Method of	AML2	0.778				
Learning	AML3	0.826				
	AML4	0.730				
	AML5	0.789				
	AML6	0.716				
	AML7	0.843				
	AML8	0.788				
Employability	E1	0.741	0.909	0.921	0.928	0.648
	E2	0.854				
	E3	0.847				
	E4	0.844				
	E5	0.714				
	E7	0.887				
	E8	0.729				
Industry	IC1	0.841	0.911	0.920	0.929	0.688
Curriculum	IC2	0.887				
	IC4	0.814				
	IC5	0.831				
	IC7	0.710				
	IC8	0.880				
Vocational	VE1	0.926	0.963	0.965	0.970	0.843
Education	VE2	0.913				
	VE4	0.930				
	VE5	0.923				
	VE7	0.866				
	VE8	0.949				

For discriminant validity, both Fornell & Larckek Criterion and HTMT, i.e. Heterotrait-Monotrait, were used. The results are shown below in table 2:

Table 2

Fornell-Larcker Criterion							
	AML	Ε	IC	VE			
AML	0.788						
E	0.521	0.805					
IC	-0.255	-0.311	0.829				
VE	0.671	0.446	-0.392	0.918			



Figure 1: Measurement Model Assessment

Moreover, HTMT, i.e. Heterotrait-Monotrait, was also used to determine the presence of discriminant validity. For discriminant value to be present in variable the HTMT value mustn't exceed 0.9. The table 3 below shows the results in the details

Table 3

HTMT

	AML	Ε	IC	VE
AML				
E	0.554			
IC	0.267	0.317		
VE	0.712	0.466	0.395	

The results shown in table 4, show a significant relationship between the VE and IC which is an incentive for better employability. The same is true for IC and E and AML and E, as both apprenticeship and industry curriculum positively relate to employability. On the other hand, AML and IC do not show any significant relation as well as those of VE and E. by virtue of the following results, three hypotheses are supported, whereas two are not supported. In all three supporting hypotheses, i.e., H1, H3 and H5 the value of ""p"" is less than 0.05, while the values of ""t"" is higher than 1.64 without any zero in between them, which is supporting our studies. On the contrary, in the other two hypotheses, i.e. H2 and H4, the values of ""t"" 0.173 and 1.373 and 0.085, respectively. By this, it is evident that no relation exists between AML, IC, and VE and E.

Anas Ratib Alsoud - Omar Abdeljaber - Mohd Shukri Ab Yajid - Johar MGM - Sultan Al-masaeed	-
Shakeerah Mohd Shukri / Eurasian Journal of Educational Research 96 (2021) 302-320	

Table 4

Main Effects

		Std. Beta	Sample Mean	Std. Error	T Statistics	P Values	Results
H1	VE -> IC	-0.402	-0.403	0.067	6.017	0.000	Supported
H2	AML -> IC	0.015	0.012	0.087	0.173	0.431	Not Supported
H3	IC -> E	-0.164	-0.165	0.061	2.701	0.003	Supported
H4	VE -> E	0.110	0.112	0.080	1.373	0.085	Not Supported
H5	AML -> E	0.406	0.407	0.089	4.561	0.000	Supported



Figure 2: Structural Model Assessment

The role of mediator was played by industrial curriculum (IC) between VE and E, and AML and E. To find a significant relationship between the variables mentioned above, bootstrapping analysis was run, which are given in the table below. The mediation between IC, AML and E does not support the hypothesis. On the contrary, a strong relationship between VE, E and IC. By this, it is asserted that the results supported H6 whereas H7 was not supported. The T value in H6 is 2.603 respectively, while in H7, it is 0.161.

Table 5

Indirect Effects

	Original	Sample	Standard	Т	Р	Roculte	
	Sample	Mean	Deviation	Statistics	Values	Results	
H VE -> IC -> 6 E	0.066	0.066	0.025	2.603	0.005	Supported	
H AML -> IC - 7 > E	-0.002	-0.002	0.015	0.161	0.436	Not Supported	

Conclusion

This study aimed to establish a link between vocational education, apprenticeship, industrial curriculum, and employability (Mahmut & SUNA, 2020). Seven distinct hypotheses were made in this regard, including the following: Vocational Training has a significant positive relationship with industry curriculum; apprenticeship method of learning has a significant positive relationship with industry curriculum; industry Curriculum has a significant positive relationship with employability; vocational education has a significant positive relationship with employability; not apprenticeship model of learning has a significant positive relationship with employability. Data confirmed all of the hypotheses mentioned above.

According to Eichhorst et al. (2015), Jordan's education system had the greatest enrollment rate at the elementary level (98 percent), 64.9 percent at the secondary level, and 31.7 percent at the tertiary level. In 2017, female enrollment at the primary level was 49 percent, 50.3 percent at the secondary level, and 52.9 percent at the tertiary level. Additionally, both males and females enrolled in Tertiary level Vocational Training at a rate of 4.1 percent, with women accounting for 48.6 percent of enrolment. It's remarkable to note that, despite these high statistics, Jordan's female workforce ranks fourth-lowest in the world at just 15%. According to Forster et al. (2016), research indicates that the problem is with the employability of female workers. Vocational training and apprenticeship models of education are ineffective at integrating women into the Jordanian labour sector.

Jordan 2025, a report published by the Jordanian government in 2015 (Grytnes et al., 2018). Its objective was to integrate the socioeconomic structure of society. It is an attempt to tap into the 85 percent untapped female labour. It contained about 400 policies or programmes, the primary aims of which were to promote the rule of law and equal opportunity, achieve fiscal sustainability, and establish strong institutions. This study contains two scenarios: one is targeted, and the other is baseline, or a minimum target that the government wishes to reach by 2026. By 2026, the GDP target is set at 7.5 percent, up from the baseline of 4.8 percent. Similarly, poverty and unemployment targets for 2026 are set at 8% and 9.7%, respectively, while baseline targets are set at 10% and 11.7 per cent. These figures have been significantly reduced due to COVID, as Jordan's economy is currently growing at a rate of roughly 2%. However, unemployment and poverty are at record highs of 15% and 15.7 percent, respectively (Choi et al., 2019).

Jordan's government implemented the National Strategy for Human Resource Development 2016-2025 in 2016. The fundamental objective of this policy was to ensure that both sexes had equal access to basic education. Additionally, a more egalitarian and high-quality primary education is guaranteed. There has been some development in this area since the Jordanian government has guaranteed that enrollment rates and fair access are maintained (Forster et al., 2016).

To summarise, the Jordanian education system can be improved, and skilled personnel may be provided to revitalize the Jordanian economy. What is essential is that high-quality vocational education is delivered through apprenticeships, as this mode of learning keeps up with industry curriculum, thereby increasing employability. The data gathered fully supports this inference, demonstrating a statistically significant positive association between vocational education and industrial curriculum. Additionally, industry curriculum has a considerable favourable effect on employability. Jordanian adolescents aged 15-24 had the highest literacy rate globally, at 99 percent for both males and females. This demonstrates that all is required to channel the Jordanian youth's latent potential. If vocational education and training (VET) is effective from a pedagogical, labour market, and academic standpoint, the employability rate will be high. Similarly, the difference between vacation and academic education and between industry curriculum and academic curriculum would be minimal.

References

- Al-Balas, M., Al-Balas, H. I., Jaber, H. M., Obeidat, K., Al-Balas, H., Aborajooh, E. A., Al-Taher, R., & Al-Balas, B. (2020). Distance learning in clinical medical education amid COVID-19 pandemic in Jordan: current situation, challenges, and perspectives. *BMC medical education*, 20(1), 1-7. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-020-02257-4</u>
- Al-Zyoud, M. S. N.-a. (2015). Benefits of teaching interdisciplinary subjects collaboratively in Jordanian pre-vocational education. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 10(20), 2702-2712. <u>https://doi.org/10.5897/ERR2015.2461</u>
- Alrabba, M. I. M. (2017). The determinants of unemployment rate in Jordan: a multivariate approach. International Journal of Economics and Finance, 9(11), 109-117. <u>https://doi.org/10.5539/ijef.v9n11p109</u>
- Alsaâ, M. (2016). Educational demands to reduce avoidance of vocational education in Jordan. Educational Research and Reviews, 11(8), 598-622. https://doi.org/10.5897/ERR2016.2636
- Assaad, R., & Krafft, C. (2016). Labor Market Dynamics and Youth Unemployment in the Middle East and North Africa: Evidence from Egypt, Jordan and Tunisia.
- Barcucci, V., Zanola, L., & Axmann, M. (2017). Vocational Education and Training (VET) and the Transition of Young Women and Men to the Labour Market in Middle-Income Countries: A Comparative Analysis Based on International Labour Organization (ILO) Surveys in Jamaica, Jordan, Peru, Tunisia, Ukraine, Vietnam and Zambia. In Vocational education and training in times of economic crisis (pp. 59-81). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-47856-2_4
- Barrera-Osorio, F., Kugler, A. D., & Silliman, M. I. (2020). Hard and soft skills in vocational training: Experimental evidence from Colombia. https://www.nber.org/papers/w27548
- Bieler, A., Joosse, A., & Bano, N. (2019). Final report on OCWI's shared apprenticeship model. <u>http://hdl.voced.edu.au/10707/531740</u>
- Billett, S. (2016). Apprenticeship as a mode of learning and model of education. *Education*+ *Training*, 58(6), 613-628. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/ET-01-2016-0001</u>
- Cahuc, P., & Hervelin, J. (2020). Apprenticeship and Youth Unemployment. https://ssrn.com/abstract=3594251
- Caputo, A., Lombardi, R., Akeel, F., Almallah, H., Dakkak, B., & Quabbaj, N. (2016). Youth employment in start-up ventures in Jordan: an exploratory study. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, 28(4), 468-491. <u>https://doi.org/10.1504/IJESB.2016.0775</u>

- Choi, S. J., Jeong, J. C., & Kim, S. N. (2019). Impact of vocational education and training on adult skills and employment: An applied multilevel analysis. *International Journal* of Educational Development, 66, 129-138. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2018.09.007
- Chua, C. J. E., Chuatoco, I. A. G., Dela Pena, A., Jimenez, D. L. F., & Co, D. A. (2017). The influence of participation in extracurricular activities to the employability of industrial engineering graduates of one private university in the Philippines. Asia Pacific Journal of Multidisciplinary Research, 5(2), 163-170. <u>https://www.academia.edu/download/62127349/APJMR-2017.5.2.1920200217-</u> 27810-1fsroua.pdf
- Cocks, E., Thoresen, S. H., & Lee, E. A. L. (2015). Pathways to employment and quality of life for apprenticeship and traineeship graduates with disabilities. *International Journal of Disability, Development and Education,* 62(4), 422-437. https://doi.org/10.1080/1034912X.2015.1025714
- Collet, C., Hine, D., & Du Plessis, K. (2015). Employability skills: perspectives from a knowledge-intensive industry. *Education+ Training*, 57(5), 532-559. https://doi.org/10.1108/ET-07-2014-0076
- Daly, P. (2017). Business apprenticeship: a viable business model in management education. *Journal of Management Development*, 36(6), 734-742. https://doi.org/10.1108/JMD-10-2015-0148
- Eichhorst, W., Rodríguez-Planas, N., Schmidl, R., & Zimmermann, K. F. (2015). A road map to vocational education and training in industrialized countries. *Ilr Review*, 68(2), 314-337. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0019793914564963</u>
- Ellahi, R. M., Khan, M. U. A., & Shah, A. (2019). Redesigning Curriculum in line with Industry 4.0. *Procedia computer science*, 151, 699-708. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2019.04.093</u>
- Fernández, M. (2015). An Apprenticeship in Reading. In *Theoretical Fables* (pp. 1-16). University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Foley, G. (2004a). *Dimensions of Adult Learning*. Open University Press. <u>https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=-Aw NpM-OMMC</u>
- Foley, G. (2004b). *Dimensions Of Adult Learning: Adult Education and Training in a Global Era*. Open University Press. https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=uaLIAAAAQBAJ
- Forster, A. G., Bol, T., & Van de Werfhorst, H. G. (2016). Vocational education and employment over the life cycle. *Sociological Science*, *3*, 473-494. https://doi.org/10.15195/v3.a21
- Grytnes, R., Grill, M., Pousette, A., Törner, M., & Nielsen, K. J. (2018). Apprentice or student? The structures of construction industry vocational education and training in Denmark and Sweden and their possible consequences for safety learning. *Vocations and Learning*, 11(1), 65-87. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s12186-017-9180-0</u>
- Guilbert, L., Bernaud, J.-L., Gouvernet, B., & Rossier, J. (2016). Employability: review and research prospects. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Guidance*, 16(1), 69-89. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10775-015-9288-4</u>

- Hampf, F., & Woessmann, L. (2017). Vocational vs. general education and employment over the life cycle: New evidence from PIAAC. *CESifo Economic Studies*, 63(3), 255-269. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/cesifo/ifx012</u>
- Heuser, P. B. (2021). How does a battle become mythical? *Res Militaris*, 11(1), 1-18. <u>https://resmilitaris.net/index.php/2021/01/01/comment-une-bataille-devient-mythique/</u>
- Higgs, J., Letts, W., & Crisp, G. (2019). Education for Employability (Volume 2): Learning for Future Possibilities. Brill. https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=0bSrDwAAQBAJ
- Hodge, S. (2016). Alienating curriculum work in Australian vocational education and training. *Critical Studies in Education*, 57(2), 143-159. https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2015.1009842
- Ilyas, M., & Afzal, N. (2021). Teaching Literary Texts through Cultural Model to EFL Students. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 7(2), 22-30. https://doi.org/10.32601/ejal.911502
- Ishengoma, E., & Vaaland, T. I. (2016). Can university-industry linkages stimulate student employability? *Education+ Training*, 58(1), 18-44. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/ET-11-2014-0137</u>
- Ito, H., & Kawazoe, N. (2015). Active Learning for Creating Innovators: Employability Skills beyond Industrial Needs. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 4(2), 81-91. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1060578</u>
- Jaber, K. A. (2019). Income distribution in Jordan. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429044557
- Jacoby, T., & Lerman, R. I. (2019). Industry-Driven Apprenticeship: What Works, What's Needed. Washington, DC: Opportunity America. http://hdl.voced.edu.au/10707/518230
- Jones, A. (2018). Vocational education for the twenty-first century. http://hdl.voced.edu.au/10707/461905
- Kim, J.-R. (2021). Using Markedness Principle for Abstraction of Dependency Relations of Natural Languages. Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 7(2), 58-67. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1312194</u>
- Komariah, K. (2015). The Role of Work-Based Learning in Building Employability Skills of Vocational Education Students. 3rd UPI International Conference on Technical and Vocational Education and Training,
- Korber, M., & Oesch, D. (2019). Vocational versus general education: Employment and earnings over the life course in Switzerland. Advances in Life Course Research, 40, 1-13. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.alcr.2019.03.003</u>
- Kuehn, D. P. (2017). Diversity and inclusion in apprenticeship expansion. <u>https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/93831/diversity-and-inclusion-in-apprenticeship-expansion.pdf</u>
- KURNIAWAN, D. A., PERDANA, R., Diki, C., & WULANDARI, M. (2021). Impact of the Integration of Ethno-mathematics with TPACK framework as a problem-based learning (PBL) model. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 96(96), 217-239. <u>https://ejer.info/index.php/journal/article/view/554</u>

- Lice, A., & Sloka, B. (2019). Performance of vocational education in Latvia in developing employability of graduates. SOCIETY. INTEGRATION. EDUCATION. Proceedings of the International Scientific Conference,
- Lipińska, E. J. (2021). Koncepcja ekozarządzania miastami w kontekście zrównoważonego rozwoju i odpowiedzialności społecznej. *socialspacejournal.eu*, 21(1), 117-135. <u>https://socialspacejournal.eu/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Social-Space-</u> Journal-1202121.pdf
- MAGALLANES, K., CHUNG, J. Y., & Suyeon, J. (2021). A Policy Analysis of Philippine School System Reform Using Advocacy Coalition Framework. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 96(96), 136-152. <u>https://ejer.info/index.php/journal/article/view/546</u>
- Mahmut, Ö., & SUNA, H. E. (2020). The linkage between vocational education and labor market in Turkey: Employability and skill mismatch. *Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi*, 28(2), 558-569. <u>https://doi.org/10.24106/kefdergi.704878</u>
- Melhem, M. A. (2021). The Impact of Assertiveness Training on Improving Social Efficacy among Higher Basic Stage Bullied Students. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 21(3), 27-39. https://doi.org/10.12738/jestp.2021.3.003
- Mindham, J., & Schultz, D. (2019). The Impact of Youth Apprenticeship and Employability Skills Programs on Career & Technical Education Concentrator-Completer Post Graduation Outcomes. *Career and Technical Education Research*, 44(3), 3-14. https://doi.org/10.5328/cter44.3.3
- Munishi, D., & Emmanuel, J. (2016). Factors contributing to lack of employable skills among technical and vocational education (TVET) graduates in Tanzania. http://dspace.cbe.ac.tz:8080/xmlui/handle/123456789/111
- Nguyen, N. V. T., Pham, H. T., Nguyen, M. T., Nguyen, N. T. H., An, T. B., & Do, L. T. (2021). Developing Experiment Skills for Pre-service Teachers of Biology in Vietnam. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 21(3), 57-73. https://doi.org/10.12738/jestp.2021.3.005
- O'Connor, H., & Bodicoat, M. (2017). Exploitation or opportunity? Student perceptions of internships in enhancing employability skills. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 38(4), 435-449. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/01425692.2015.1113855</u>
- Rageth, L., & Renold, U. (2020). The linkage between the education and employment systems: ideal types of vocational education and training programs. *Journal of Education Policy*, 35(4), 503-528. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/02680939.2019.1605541</u>
- Sa-Nguanmanasak, T., & Khampirat, B. (2019). Comparing employability skills of technical and vocational education students of Thailand and Malaysia: A case study of international industrial work-integrated learning. *Journal of Technical Education* and Training, 11(3), 94-110. <u>https://doi.org/10.30880/jtet.2019.11.03.012</u>
- Shahroom, A. A., & Hussin, N. (2018). Industrial revolution 4.0 and education. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 8(9), 314-319. https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS%2FV8-I9%2F4593
- Sulaiman, G., & Ambotang, A. S. (2017). The Role of Basic Vocational Education Towards Students Employability. *International Journal of Vocational Education and Training Research*, 3(1), 1-6. <u>http://article.sciencepublishinggroup.com/pdf/10.11648.j.ijvetr.20170301.11.pd</u> f

- Teng, W., Ma, C., Pahlevansharif, S., & Turner, J. J. (2019). Graduate readiness for the employment market of the 4th industrial revolution: The development of soft employability skills. *Education+ Training*, 61(5), 590-604. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/ET-07-2018-0154</u>
- Wheelahan, L., & Moodie, G. (2017). Vocational education qualifications' roles in pathways to work in liberal market economies. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 69(1), 10-27. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2016.1275031</u>